



Minutes of the 35th Meeting of the Finance Committee

The 35th Meeting of the Finance Committee of the Central University of Punjab, was held on 26th December 2024 (3:00 p.m.) through hybrid Mode.

Venue: Conference Room, Aryabhata Academic Block, Adjacent Vice-Chancellor's Office.

The list of the members present during the meeting is annexed.

The Chairperson formally welcomed the members of the Finance Committee and thanked them for sparing their valuable time from their busy schedule to attend the 35th meeting of the Finance Committee for making it possible to attend this meeting in hybrid mode.

After detailed discussions on the agenda items listed for this meeting, the unanimous resolutions of the Finance Committee are as follows:

Items for Consideration	
<p><u>Item.No:FC:35:2024:1</u></p> <p>To approve the Minutes of 59th Meeting of the Building Committee held on 21.12.2024.</p>	<p><u>AGENDA NOTE:</u></p> <p>The 59th meeting of the Building Committee was held on 21.12.2024. The minutes are enclosed as <i>Annexure-35.1</i>.</p> <p>The minutes of 59th meeting of the Building Committee held on 21.12.2024 is placed before the Finance Committee for approval.</p>
<p><u>RESOLVE:</u></p>	<p>The Finance Committee discussed the item in detail and unanimously resolved to approve the minutes of 59th Meeting of the Building Committee held on 21.12.2024 except for the <u>item.No.:BC:59:2024:10</u> regarding <i>finalization of the PMC for execution of works under the HEFA Term Loan of Rs. 210.99 Cr sanctioned to the University</i>, for which the Finance Committee has resolved separately vide <u>item No.FC:35:2024:2</u>.</p>
<p><u>Item.No:FC:35:2024:2</u></p> <p>To consider and approve the recommendation of the 59th Meeting of the Building Committee regarding the finalization of the Appointment of PMC for execution of construction works under the HEFA Term Loan of Rs 210.99 crore sanctioned to the University.</p>	<p><u>AGENDA NOTE:</u></p> <p>The matter for appointment of Project Management Consultant (PMC) for construction of New buildings was considered by Building Committee in its 58th meeting held on 08.08.2024 vide agenda item no: Item: BC: 58:2024:11.</p> <p>The recommendations of Building Committee for selection of PMC among PSU's through QCBS method by inviting EOI on similar terms of CU Haryana were considered and approved by the Finance Committee in its 33rd meeting held on 30.08.2024 vide agenda item no FC:33:2024:2 and the Executive Council in its 52nd meeting held on 19.08.2024 vide agenda item no EC:52:2024:4.</p>



After the approval from the above Committees, a Consultancy Evaluation Committee (CEC) was constituted vide notification no. CUPB/RO/Notification/24-25/53 dated 17.09.2024 (**Annexure – 35.2**). The Expression of Interest for hiring Project Management Consultancy Services for Planning, Designing and Development of the infrastructural facilities and other related works was called on CPP portal, e-publish on GeM-CPPP and University website on 23.09.2024. The pre-bid meeting was held on 30.09.2024 at 11 AM and minutes were uploaded on the university website.

The three firms i.e. Engineers India Limited, RITES Limited and NBCC (India) Limited participated in the Expression of Interest (EOI) and were found eligible as per EOI document.

As per rule 186 of GFR 2017, the Request for Proposal (RFP) as finalized by CEC in its 4th Meeting was sent to all the eligible bidders on 06.11.2024. The approved minutes of 1st to 4th meeting of CEC are placed (**Annexure – 35.3**).

The CEC in its 5th meeting held on 20.11.2024 noted the details of the queries raised by the firms and the reply of the queries was intimated to all the three bidder through email dated 25.11.2024. The approved minutes of 5th meeting of CEC are placed (**Annexure – 35.4**). The last date of submission of technical and Financial bids was 28.11.2024. All the three bidders submitted their technical and financial bids on or before the last date of submission i.e. 28.11.2024. The bids of all the three bidders were opened by CEC in its 6th Meeting. The approved minutes of 6th meeting of CEC are placed (**Annexure – 35.5**).

Based on the submitted documents, the Consultancy Evaluation Committee in its 7th meeting held on 06.12.2024 evaluated the technical score of the three eligible firms. The minutes comprising of technical score (documents) were circulated to CEC members through email dated 06.12.24 (**Annexure – 35.6**). The approved minutes of 7th meeting of CEC are placed (**Annexure – 35.7**).

Thereafter, the presentation of all the three eligible firms were scheduled on 09.12.2024. Based on the presentations, the CEC members evaluated the technical score for the presentation based on different parameters detailed in RFP document and as per the relative weightage informed to all the bidders. The presentation of the eligible bidders was held on 09.12.2024, wherein all the members of CEC evaluated the bidders based on the presentation and accordingly, the consolidated technical score including document and presentation was finalized by CEC in its 8th meeting held on



09.12.2024. The minutes comprising of technical score (documents) & Technical Score (Presentation) were circulated to CEC members through email dated 09.12.24 (**Annexure – 35.8**). The approved minutes of 8th meeting of CEC are placed (**Annexure – 35.9**). The technical scores are as under:

Sr.No.	Name of the bidder	Technical score (Documents)	Technical score (Presentation)	Total technical score
1.	M/s Engineers India Limited	62.86	22.20	85.06
2.	M/s RITES Limited	60.14	20.40	80.54
3.	M/s NBCC (India) Limited	68.29	25.00	93.29

On the recommendations of CEC in its 8th meeting and approval of Competent Authority, the financial bids were opened on 12.12.2024 with prior information to all the three firms and its publicity on the university website. The representatives of all the three eligible firms were present during the financial bid opening. They also checked and verified the sealed envelopes of the financial bid submitted by their respective organization. The financial quote of the bidders is tabulated as under:

Sr. No.	Name of the bidder	Financial quote
1.	M/s Engineers India Limited	6.23%
2.	M/s RITES Limited	2.95%
3.	M/s NBCC (India) Limited	4.50%

As the EOI and the RFP document were called on QCBS method, wherein the technical score (TS) and the financial score (FS) are given the relative weightage as detailed in the RFP document and the composite score (CS) is calculated using the following formula:

$$CS = 0.80 \times TS + 0.20 \times FS.$$

Accordingly, the consolidated score of all the three eligible has been calculated as under:

Sr. No.	Name of the bidder	Technical score (TS)	Financial Score (FS)	Composite score (CS) (CS = 0.80 x TS + 0.20 x FS)	Rating
1.	M/s Engineers India Limited	85.06	47.35	77.52	H3
2.	M/s RITES Limited	80.54	100	84.43	H2
3.	M/s NBCC (India) Limited	93.29	65.56	87.74	H1



As per clause no. 7.4 of the RFP document, The TQB's will be ranked accordingly to their **Composite Scores** and will be listed in the order of merit as H1, H2 and H3 and so on. The top scorer bidder (H1) shall be eligible for the award of the work as PMC.

As per recommendations of the CEC in its 9th meeting held on 12.12.2024 (**Annexure – 35.10**), the work for Appointment of the PMC for the construction of new buildings in the Central University of Punjab may be awarded to the **H1 bidder M/s NBCC (India) Limited at its quoted price of rates of 4.5% plus GST.**

The case as above was considered by the Building Committee in its 59th Meeting Held on 21.12.24 for allotment of the work to H1 bidder M/s NBCC (India) Limited at its quoted price of rates of 4.5% plus GST.

Following discussions were held during the 59th Building Committee Meeting:

During the meeting, the members of the Committee discussed the matter and enquired about the detailed process adopted for hiring of Project Management Consultant for construction works. Executive Engineer, CU Punjab informed that as per Rule no. 192 to 194 of GFR 2017, three methods are prescribed for selection of consultancy firm. All the three methods were discussed in detail during the 24th meeting of PMC and 58th Meeting of BC. On the recommendations of PMC and approval of Building Committee in its 58th meeting, the Quality & Cost Based Selection (QCBS) method was adopted in the present case. The Executive Engineer also informed the BC that various technical parameters used in evaluation and their relative score was already detailed in RFP document. Further different parameters for presentation and their relative weightage were also informed to all the three bidders through email. As such entire selection process was carried out in the transparent manner.

Further, Er. Rajender Kalla, Additional Director General (Retd.), CPWD informed to the Committee that QCBS is the best and most appropriate method for appointment of Consultancy Firm and therefore the same was recommended by the Building Committee in its 58th meeting. He also clarified that the technical and financial weightage ratio of 80:20 adopted by the CEC is the standard ratio generally adopted across all the Central Government works for the appointment of consultancy agency and in the QCBS method the work is awarded to the Highest composite scoring (H1) bidder.



	<p>Prof. V. K. Garg, Chairman, Project Monitoring Committee, CU Punjab, suggested that for future reference, the Engineering Office should seek information from NBCC (India) Ltd, the H1 bidder recommend by the committee through QCBS method, for Consultancy Fee including PMC, Architectural and TPQI being charged by them for 5 no. of projects (on-going/ completed) during the last 5 years. Accordingly, the information was sought from NBCC (India) Ltd through email dated 21.12.2024 and the desired information was provided by NBCC (India) Ltd through email reply (Annexure-35.11)</p> <p><u>After considering the matter, the resolution of the Building Committee is as under:</u></p> <p><i><u>"The Building Committee noted that:</u></i></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"><i><u>1. The Consultancy Evaluation Committee was constituted as per GFR-2017 and manual of procurement of consultancy services by MoF as resolved by Building Committee in its 58th Meeting vide agenda item no. BC: 58:2024:11.</u></i><i><u>2. The Committee also noted that the Selection of PMC has been done by calling EoI and RFP on QCBS method as per GFR-2017 as resolved by Building Committee in its 58th Meeting vide agenda item no. BC: 58:2024:11 and approved by the Finance Committee and Executive Council.</u></i> <p><i><u>Therefore, the Committee after deliberated discussions, unanimously resolved to approve the recommendations of the 9th meeting of Consultancy Evaluation Committee, held on 12.12.2024, to award the work for Appointment of the PMC to the H1 bidder i.e. M/s NBCC (India) Limited at its quoted consultancy fee of 4.5% plus GST for the buildings to be constructed out of new HEFA loan of Rs. 210.99 Cr. in the Central University of Punjab campus."</u></i></p> <p>The matter is placed before the Finance Committee for consideration and approval of the recommendations of 59th Meeting of the Building Committee regarding Appointment of the PMC to the H1 bidder i.e. M/s NBCC (India) Limited at its quoted consultancy fee of 4.5% plus GST for the buildings to be constructed out of new HEFA loan of Rs. 210.99 Cr. in the Central University of Punjab.</p>
<p><u>RESOLVE:</u></p>	<p>The Finance Committee after detailed discussions on the agenda item unanimously resolved that the University should negotiate with the H1 bidder i.e. M/s NBCC (India) Limited to bring down its quoted consultancy fee i.e. 4.5% plus GST.</p>



	Further, the Committee also resolved that the outcome of the negotiation be presented in the next meeting of the Finance Committee.
<u>Item.No:FC:35:2024:3</u>	Any other business items with the permission of the Chair No business items.
<u>Item.No:FC:35:2024:4</u> To fix the date of the next meeting of the Finance Committee.	The Finance Committee may like to fix the next date of meeting of the Finance Committee as per need. The Finance Committee authorized the Vice-Chancellor to fix the next date of meeting of the Finance Committee.

While discussing the agenda, the Comments received from UGC, IFD (MoE) & CU Bureau of MoE were considered by the Finance Committee.

The meeting of the Finance Committee concluded with vote of thanks from & to the Chair.

Sd/-
(Dr. Rajkumar Sharma)
Finance Officer &
Secretary, Finance Committee

Minutes Approved

Sd/-
(Prof. Raghavendra P. Tiwari)
Vice-Chancellor &
Chairman, Finance Committee